CAHSPR 2020
Panel talk

Michel Grignon ¹

¹Departments of Economics and HA&S, CHEPA, McMaster University

May, 27 2020
Outline

1. Rationing in normal times
2. What changes in crises?
3. Resources allocation to avoid crises
Rationing

- Any health care system rations: spends up to the point where resources are exhausted.
- Result is avoidable deaths or losses of quality of life (counterfactual).
- Measure (illustration): Potential Years of Life Lost (PYLL). OECD: “The calculation for PYLL involves adding up deaths occurring at each age and multiplying this with the number of remaining years to live until a selected age limit. The limit of 70 years has been chosen for the calculations in OECD Health Data.”
Tools for rationing

- Ration by services (HTA) or patients (bedside)
- $ICER = \frac{NetCost}{NetBenefit}$ How much does the intervention cost per unit of benefit? **On average.**
Uncertainty

- Uncertainty in HTA: confidence intervals and sensitivity analysis
- Uncertainty in crises: irreversibility
Opportunity cost of lock-down: 100bn (we don’t know, it is not a Bernoulli experiment but a Bayesian quest)

Gain (another counterfactual): 220,000 lives. ICER=$450,000

But if R-naught lower or fatality rate lower or value of life lower (victims are older): ICER could be much higher and values of parameters are not known at the time of the decision

Rational response: option value
Conflicting values

- Fairness trumps ICER: Oregon experiment 1990s
- Fairness relies on potentially conflicting basic principles
- Need to elicit or build these principles as a collectivity
- Illustration: Nova Scotia Fairness Dialogues (Dr. Yukiko Asada, Dalhousie)
## How to ask?
### Modes of public value elicitation (examples)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rules of communication</th>
<th>Interactive context of communication</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Unspecified</td>
<td>Communicate with oneself</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opinion surveys</td>
<td>Communicate with others</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Focus groups</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reason-giving, inclusive ethic</td>
<td>Questionnaire-based experiments (health economics)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deliberation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
A fictional, typical mid-sized town in Nova Scotia, where you and your family live…
The cost of preparedness is idle resources. We need to revise our definition of “waste”.