

CAHSPR 2020

Panel talk

Michel Grignon ¹

¹Departments of Economics and HA&S, CHEPA, McMaster University

May, 27 2020

Outline

- 1 Rationing in normal times
- 2 What changes in crises?
- 3 Resources allocation to avoid crises

Rationing

- Any health care system rations: spends up to the point where resources are exhausted
- Result is avoidable deaths or losses of quality of life (counterfactual).
- Measure (illustration): Potential Years of Life Lost (PYLL).
OECD: “The calculation for PYLL involves adding up deaths occurring at each age and multiplying this with the number of remaining years to live until a selected age limit. The limit of 70 years has been chosen for the calculations in OECD Health Data.”

Tools for rationing

- Ration by services (HTA) or patients (bedside)
- $ICER = \frac{NetCost}{NetBenefit}$ How much does the intervention cost per unit of benefit? **On average.**

Uncertainty

- Uncertainty in HTA: confidence intervals and sensitivity analysis
- Uncertainty in crises: irreversibility

Illustration

- Opportunity cost of lock-down: 100bn (we don't know, it is not a Bernoulli experiment but a Bayesian quest)
- Gain (another counterfactual): 220,000 lives.
ICER=\$450,000
- But if R-naught lower or fatality rate lower or value of life lower (victims are older): ICER could be much higher and values of parameters are not known at the time of the decision
- Rational response: option value

Conflicting values

- Fairness trumps ICER: Oregon experiment 1990s
- Fairness relies on potentially conflicting basic principles
- Need to elicit or build these principles as a collectivity
- Illustration: Nova Scotia Fairness Dialogues (Dr. Yukiko Asada, Dalhousie)

How to ask?

Modes of public value elicitation (examples)

		Interactive context of communication	
		Communicate with oneself	Communicate with others
Rules of communication	Unspecified	Opinion surveys	Focus groups
	Reason-giving, inclusive ethic	Questionnaire-based experiments (health economics)	Deliberation



A fictional, typical mid-sized town in Nova Scotia, where you and your family live...

The cost of preparedness is idle resources. We need to revise our definition of “waste”.